



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<u>British Journal of Medicine and Medical Research</u>
Manuscript Number:	2014_BJMMR_13344
Title of the Manuscript:	Effectiveness of Lumbar Puncture in Elderly Patients Presented with Acute Confusional State
Type of the Article	Short Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (<i>if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here</i>)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Inclusion and exclusion criteria are missing, as is the definition of ACS. 2. What was the presenting complain? Other symptoms and signs in the clinical presentation? 3. What diagnostic work-up was done prior to defining “no clear causes that fully explain their presentation”, since the elderly patient is quite complex (as the author stated). 4. A very small cohort, for such a basic question. No real conclusions can be made. The minimum cohort should be calculated and should be in the order of a few hundreds. 5. Tables #2, #3, #4 are lacking basic details: what infectious agent, what electrolyte disturbance and to what extent? Unknown causes? What systemic infection? What is the basic immunological competence. 6. The results in table 5 are in contrast to known incidence of infectious organisms. The author should address that. 7. The discussion is lacking. Inclusion and exclusion criteria as well as informed consent is not mentioned. 	
Minor REVISION comments	Language is poor.	
Optional/General comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	Israel