



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Medicine and Medical Research
Manuscript Number:	2014_BJMMR_13344
Title of the Manuscript:	Effectiveness of Lumbar Puncture in Elderly Patients Presented with Acute Confusional State
Type of the Article	Short Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>Thank you for the revision, it seems some work was put into the manuscript. Still major issues arise:</p> <p>Saying that "there is no clear guideline for LP indication in elderly patients" is not correct. One might dispute existing guidelines, but they do exist and should be discussed.</p> <p>The author's conclusion is identical to others stated in his introduction "While being the most valuable diagnostic tool for CNS infection, Lumbar puncture has a limited role in ACS due to its very low yield [7]".</p> <p>Acute confusional state is a very common and well established presentation of sepsis and SIRS in the elderly patient. The infectious cause should be investigated in any such patient until an infection source is found. Like in any other field of medicine, investigation should proceed from the least invasive to the more invasive and according to the incidence & prevalence of the different source. As such, CBC+CXR+UA is done before LP or Chest-CT, and UTI is more common than meningitis. There is nothing new in this paper.</p> <p>Many typing errors and grammar issues to be addressed. Very poorly written and should be completely rewritten.</p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	Israel